



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
PARK CITY, SUMMIT COUNTY, UTAH**

RE: REORIENTATION AND RELOCATION DETERMINATION

Historic Preservation Board of Park City, Utah met on Wednesday, February 6, 2019 for a regularly scheduled and duly noticed meeting. After determining that a quorum was present, the Board conducted its scheduled business.

NOTICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD ACTION:

Project Address: 424 Woodside Avenue
Project Number: PL-16-03369
Type of Item: Administrative – Material Deconstruction
Hearing Date: February 6, 2019

Board Action: APPROVED IN PART AND DENIED IN PART

The Historic Preservation Board conducted a public hearing and approved the proposed Material Deconstruction in part and denied the proposed Material Deconstruction in part.

The Historic Preservation Board found that the proposed Material Deconstruction of the items listed in Findings of Fact 34-39 would have no negative impact on the historic character of the Historic Site, surrounding neighborhood or the Historic District.

The Historic Preservation Board found that the removal of a portion of the west facing roof structure and façade to accommodate a new addition would damage the historic integrity of the structure and did not comply with the criteria for Material Deconstruction; the Historic Preservation Board made a motion to strike Finding of Fact #40 reflecting such and denying the request for that portion of the proposed Material Deconstruction.

This Determination complies with the criteria set forth in the Land Management Code. The Historic Preservation Board made the determination based on the following findings of fact, conclusions of law, and conditions of approval.

Finding of Fact:

1. The Duplex Dwelling located at 424 Woodside Avenue is listed as “Significant” on the Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI).
2. The property is located in the Historic Residential (HR-1) zone.

3. The Historic Structure faces towards Main Street in that the original primary entrance faces east. In 1993, a 700 square foot (SF) addition was constructed to the south of the Historic Structure to create the Duplex Dwelling Use.
4. In 2005 a Plat Amendment was approved creating a 75 foot wide lot by combining three (3) existing lots into one legal lot of record. The Historic Structure straddles two (2) of the three (3) lots that were combined.
5. On November 16, 2016, the applicant submitted a HDDR Application for the subject property. At the time, the project scope of the HDDR included: Reorient (rotate) the Historic Structure so that the primary entrance faces Woodside Avenue (west) and Relocate the Historic Structure ten feet (10') to the east in order to comply with the minimum Front Yard Setback.
6. After working with the applicant on the required materials for their submittal, the current HDDR application was deemed complete on March 2, 2017. Between March 2, 2017 and the first HPB meeting on July 19, 2017, staff provided the applicant with redline comments and re-reviewed new plans addressing those comments once submitted by the applicant.
7. The Historic Preservation Board held a public hearing and continued this item on July 19th, 2017.
8. The Historic Preservation Board held a public hearing and continued this item on October 4th, 2017.
9. The Historic Preservation Board held a public hearing, discussed the item, and continued this item on December 5th, 2017.
10. The Historic Preservation Board held a public hearing and continued this item on February 7th, 2018.
11. The Historic Preservation Board held a public hearing, discussed the item, and continued this item on March 7th, 2018 in order to facilitate a site visit at the request of the applicant.
12. The Historic Preservation Board conducted a site visit, held a public hearing, discussed the item, and continued this item on April 4th, 2018.
13. The Historic Preservation Board held a public hearing, discussed the item, and denied the Relocation and Reorientation of the Historic Structure at 424 Woodside Avenue with a 5 to 1 vote on May 2, 2018.
14. On May 22, 2018, staff issued a Denial Letter for the HDDR application.
15. On June 4, 2018, the City received an application for an appeal of the Historic Preservation Board's decision for the Relocation and Reorientation of the Historic Structure at 424 Woodside Avenue. On June 15, 2018, the Appellant provided supplemental information. This application was accepted within 30 days of the Final Action of the HPB.
16. On July 12, 2018 the City Council reviewed the appeal, held a public hearing, and directed staff to return with findings of fact granting the Appeal in part to approve the Relocation and deny the Appeal in part to uphold the HPB's decision regarding the Reorientation.
17. On August 2, 2018, City Council continued the discussion to August 16, 2018 regarding the ratification of the Findings of Fact for the Appeal.

18. On August 16, 2018, City Council granted the Appeal in part to approve the Relocation and denied the Appeal in part to uphold the HPB's decision regarding the Reorientation.
19. On December 7, 2018, the applicant submitted drawings that complied with the City Council's August 16, 2018 action and the Land Management Code. The new proposal is to relocate the structure ten feet (10') to the east, lift the structure one foot eleven inches (1'11"), renovate the historic portion of the structure, and construct an addition between the existing south addition and historic portion of the structure.
20. The Historic Structure was constructed ca. 1886. The Park City HSI identifies the Historic Structure as significant to the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930).
21. Originally, the Historic Structure was a hall-parlor type single-family dwelling with a side-gabled roof; it was built on a relatively steep slope that was terraced toward the rear of the house (the Woodside Avenue side) to provide a more level building lot.
22. Historically, the Historic Structure was associated with a network of pedestrian paths on the east side of the structure that connected the residence to Main Street.
23. The Historic Structure first appears on the 1889 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as a wood-framed and wood-sided house originally faced east, providing a view over Main Street. Physical evidence and the 1889 Sanborn map indicate that it had a small shed-roofed wing on the south end of the rear (west) side but no front porch.
24. By 1900, the original shed-roofed wing had been extended across the rear (west) side.
25. In 1907, the Sanborn Map indicates that a formal front porch was added to the east side, further defining it as the primary façade, at the same time that a secondary entry porch was added to the west side. The house retained this configuration through 1930.
26. The principal façade was composed of a central doorway flanked by a window on each side. Woodside Avenue was present to the west, but access to the house was via a footpath leading north from Fourth Street behind the Park Avenue houses, and then a short staircase leading up to the east façade. The orientation of houses along the uphill (west) side of Woodside was uniformly east-facing, while orientations along the downhill (east) side was mixed, with some facing the street and others the canyon.
27. By 1941, a second shed-roofed addition had been built across the west side, incorporating the 1907 rear screened porch and essentially filling the terrace between the rear wall of the house and the retaining wall so that the eave was nearly at grade. The front porch had been removed and asbestos shingles had been applied over the original wood siding by this time.
28. Asbestos shingle siding was noted on the 1957 tax appraisal card, which also documents the absence of an east porch.
29. The 1968 tax appraisal card indicates that a porch had been rebuilt across the east façade.
30. Between 1978 and 1993, the east façade was modified by the addition of a sunroom across the north two-thirds, covering the original doorway and north window.
31. The east façade of the Historic Structure is the "front". This is supported by the traditional design of a central entrance door flanked by two (2) windows. This is a

common style of architecture seen throughout Park City. The “rear” of the Historic structure is the west façade. This is represented by its traditional form created through additions throughout the Historic period.

32. The front façade has a front door entrance; however, a utility entrance is also located on the northwest corner of the structure in the rear enclosed porch addition. This was also a common occurrence in houses throughout Park City. (Examples include the side-enclosed porches at 1057 Woodside Avenue and 811 Norfolk Avenue). This utility entrance was often the entrance used by members of the household as a “mud room” so that the front entrance (on the front façade) remained clean.
33. Both entrances typically would have been used throughout the Historic Period; it would have simply depended on what the occasion was.
34. The applicant intends to replace non-historic materials with historically compatible materials. The removal of the proposed non-historic materials will assist in restoring the duplex dwelling to its Historic Form because the existing non-historic materials are incompatible and/or beyond repair.
35. The applicant will remove the non-historic windows. Replacement windows will not change the dimensions of the existing windows and will be compatible with the historic structure.
36. The applicant will remove the non-historic east entrance railing.
37. The applicant will remove the foundation to accommodate a new basement foundation.
38. The applicant will remove the non-historic door on the north façade. Replacement door will not change the dimensions of the existing door and will be compatible with the historic structure.
39. The applicant will remove the non-historic rear porch enclosure. The applicant will reconstruct the historic porch. The reconstructed porch will require the removal of a portion of the roof; however, this will restore an architectural feature that was previously removed.
40. The Historic Preservation Board made a motion to strike Finding of Fact #40.
41. The Historic Preservation Board found that the removal of a portion of the west facing roof structure and façade to accommodate a new addition would damage the historic integrity does not comply with the criteria for Material Deconstruction.
42. Staff finds that the removal of the proposed non-historic materials will assist in the renovation of the duplex dwelling to its Historic Form because the existing non-historic materials are incompatible and/or beyond repair. In addition, the applicant will be restoring Historic features that have been lost.

Conclusions of Law:

1. The proposal complies with the Land Management Code requirements pursuant to the HR-1 District and regarding material deconstruction.

Conditions of Approval:

1. Final building plans and construction details shall reflect substantial compliance with the HDDR proposal stamped in on December 7, 2018. Any changes, modifications,

or deviations from the approved design that have not been approved by the Planning and Building Departments may result in a stop work order.

2. Where the historic exterior materials cannot be repaired, they shall be replaced with materials that match the original in all respects: scale, dimension, texture, profile, material and finish. Prior to removing and replacing historic materials, the applicant shall demonstrate to the Planning Director and Project Planner that the materials are no longer safe and/or serviceable and cannot be repaired to a safe and/or serviceable condition. No historic materials may be disposed of prior to advance approval by the Planning Director and Project Planner.
3. Any deviation from approved Material Deconstruction will require review by the Historic Preservation Board.
4. A structural engineer shall be responsible for creating a cribbing plan prior to the house being supported from the interior for the installation of the new concrete foundation. Within five (5) days of installation, the structural engineer will inspect and approve the cribbing as constructed. If the cribbing is to be relocated or altered at any time during the construction of the foundation, the structural engineer shall create and approve a new cribbing plan. The structural engineer shall re-inspect and re-approve the cribbing within five (5) days of any relocation or alteration to the cribbing.
5. Historic buildings which are lifted must be returned to the completed foundation within 45 days of lifting the building. Failure to do so will be a violation of the Preservation Plan and enforcement action through the financial guarantee for historic preservation could take place. The Planning Director may make a written determination to extend this period up to 30 additional days if, after consultation with the Historic Preservation Planner, Chief Building Official, and City Engineer, he determines that it is necessary based upon the need to immediately stabilize an existing Historic property, or specific site conditions such as access, or lack thereof, exist, or in an effort to reduce impacts on adjacent properties.
6. The Preservation Plan must include a review and stamp by a licensed and registered structural engineer on the proposed cribbing or shoring methods. If the contractor makes a revision to the cribbing or shoring plan, the structural engineer must approve the change in writing. Cribbing or shoring must be of engineered materials. Screw-type jacks for raising and lowering the building are not allowed. The owner (or through its agent or the contractor) is responsible for notifying the Planning Department if changes are made.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding this letter, please do not hesitate to call me at (435) 615-5059 or contact me by email at hannah.tyler@parkcity.org.

Sincerely,



Hannah M. Tyler
Planner